HISTORICAL REENACTMENT AS STYLIZED IDENTITY AND ITS CREATIVE POTENTIAL: BAKHTINIAN APPROACH TO THE SOCIO-CULTURAL IDENTITY[1]

Alexander SAUTKIN

Murmansk State Humanities University,
Department of Philosophy and Law,
Egorova str. 15, 183720 Murmansk, Russia
E-mail: sautkin72@mail.ru

This paper analyzes socio-cultural identity finding its expression in creative activity. As a methodological basis the dialogic approach of Mikhail Bakhtin is used. It allows typologizing ways of constructing and expressing identity. There are three main types: direct, object, and double-voiced (ambivalent) identity. A particular case of double-voiced identity is stylized identity, implying reproduction of some value and behavioral patterns while maintaining a certain distance towards them. Stylization-identity is considered on the example of the historical reenactment subculture. Theoretical considerations are illustrated with a case-study of creative activity of reenactment clubs from Murmansk (Russia), recreating the Viking Age. Historical reenactment is considered as a possible source for development of creative industry projects.

Keywords: creative product, dialogism, historical reenactment, identity, stylization.

Introduction

A specific way of understanding and experiencing life always manifests itself in any creative work, having not only individually-personal character, being as well rooted in the person's correlation with a particular socio-cultural group. Consequently, we can talk about the interconnection between creative activity and actual socio-cultural identities of the activity actor. Analysis of creative products can detect identity characteristics of the creator and put his attitudes into the appropriate ideological contexts.

Of course, we are not dealing with a kind of art-analysis here; neither are we going to interpret creative products[2] in the way of vulgar sociology of Vladimir Fritsche or Soviet Proletcult's leaders, who believed that cultural phenomena directly reflect deliberate social-class position of their creators.

We are not trying to explain creative products themselves by means of some identifications – on the contrary, we are interested in an explanation of identifications, based on analysis of the creativity products. Creative actors' strategies can vary significantly depending on many factors. Some of them assume a distinct and unambiguous, often politically engaged expression of identity: political posters or cartoons, shocking street protests like those held by different actionist groups (e.g. Ukrainian FEMEN or Russian "War" art group), etc.

In its limit the manifestation of identity can take form of the artist's work with his own body, as the famous "Art must be beautiful. Artist must be beautiful" performance of Marina Abramović or the sensational "Fixation" action by Saint Petersburg artist Petr Pavlensky who nailed his genitals to the cobblestones in Red Square in Moscow.

The opposite pole is the ultimate distancing of creative actor from his product; the example here is the work of famous Portuguese poet Fernando Pessoa, who wrote his texts not only under his own name, but also under a variety of aliases, and each alias meant independent creative person with his own biography and artistic style, not identified with Pessoa himself.

In this paper, we are interested in such creative products that are marked with pronounced manifestations of an identity, to some extent having a stylized character, i.e. it is not the complete identification, and it retains some distance. It is possible to investigate this type of identity using the ideas of Bakhtin.

Socio-cultural identity in the Bakhtinian perspective

Many of Bakhtin's ideas, expressed in relation to the philological and literary issues, in our opinion, can be applied to other research areas. Thus, in particular, his idea of dialogism seems to be very productive for understanding the social and cultural identification processes, as they are always an ongoing dialogue on the consciousness border. As Bakhtin wrote,

> "I am aware of myself and become myself only revealing myself for another, through another, and with the help of another. The most important acts constituting self-consciousness are determined by the attitude to another consciousness (to You). <…> Not something that is going on inside, but something happening on the border of one's own and other's consciousness, on the threshold. And the entire interior does not prevail itself, being turned outward and dialogized, and each inner experience is at the border meeting another, and this tense meeting contains the very essence" (Bakhtin 1997: 343–344).

---

[2] We will use the term "creative product" rather than a "work of art" because our field of research includes not only the latter. For instance, handmade decorative or utilitarian objects, as well as organization and conduct of costumed performances by "historical reenactment" fans in the strict sense do not fall under the definition of "work of art", but may well be considered as the result of creative activity, as a "cultural product".

Identity is based on the reflection of one's own relation to the Other: I am aware of and express my involvement or non-involvement with anything. Therefore, in a certain way I express my identity – in a word, a gesture, a creative act, etc. This statement of my identity can be differently oriented with regard to the other's word, which is necessarily present (possibly in a latent form) in my identity and its expression (verbal, gesture, creative and so on).

In our view, here we can use a typology of prose found in Bakhtin's book *Problems of Dostoevsky's Art* and analyzed by Julia Kristeva in her famous article "Word, Dialogue, and Novel". This typology includes three basic types of prose (Bakhtin 2000: 96):

- Direct word aimed straight at its subject, as an expression of the last sense instance of the speaker;
- Object word (of a character);
- Word with the attitude to the other's words (double-voiced word)[3].

We believe that this typology may well be attributed to the statement of identity. The "author" in this case is the subject of identification, since it is him who builds up the "text" of his own identity in correlation with Others (considered as "characters"). According to Bakhtin, "direct intentional word knows only itself and its subject, to which it aims to be as adequate as possible" (Bakhtin 2000: 83). According to the remark of Kristeva, this word "is ignorant" of the others' impact on it" (Kristeva 2000: 437).

> "Direct" (or "subject", "presentive") identification, corresponding to this type of the author's word, will be a stable identification of a person with a certain set of characteristics, beyond which a person cannot imagine oneself. This type of identity is the least amenable to transformations: such statement of identity "is ignorant" about the impact of the words of Others, the subject of identity cannot imagine such an impact, for Other is wholly excluded here: such "excluded Other" is not involved in a dialogue – he is either ignored or destroyed.

This identity is of monological nature, although it also potentially contains some dialogic features, for it is a statement addressed to somebody, and hence included in the structure of the dialogue. The example of such identity is gender identity (constructed socially and dialogically, but fixated and legitimized by "secondary naturalization", i.e. through the fictitious appeal to nature).

The second type of identity can be related to what Bakhtin called "object word". Bakhtin describes it this way:

> "Object word is also directed only on the subject, but at the same time it is itself the object of someone else's authorial intention. But this other's intention does not penetrate the object word, it takes it as a whole and subordinates to certain tasks, without changing its meaning and tone. It does not put another presentive sense in it" (Bakhtin 2000: 85).

In this situation, the subject word of the Other, becoming an object for the subject word of the identity subject (i.e., becoming an "object word"), is itself "ignorant"

---

[3] Kristeva refers to the term "ambivalent" in her article.

that it is paid with attention. A person hears the Other, but does not affect him. Consequently, the "object word" is only a ready-to-use holistic ideologem in which the subject of identification does not make any changes, but "subordinates to his tasks", i.e. uses solely according to his interests and even probably in contradiction with the basic meaning of such ideologems.

For example, the identity of some groups of the so-called "Orthodox activists" making noisy (and sometimes violent) actions, clearly contradicts the paradigm of Christian behavior and values of the Sermon on the Mount; however, by reason of their monological attitude to the other's word, that word is not clear for them, so it remains one-voiced.

The third type of identity is comparable to Bakhtin's "double-voiced (or ambivalent) word" which is dialogic already in the proper sense. Bakhtin writes about it:

> "<…> author can use someone else's word for his own purposes and by the way of adding a new intention into the word which is already having its own subject intention and keeping it. And this word on purpose must be perceived as the other's one. In one word there occur two intentions, two voices" (Bakhtin 2000: 85).

The subtypes of the "double-voiced (ambivalent) word", and therefore of the "ambivalent identity", are: 1) stylization, 2) parody, and 3) hidden internal controversy. We intend to devote separate publications to the detailed analysis of the latter two subtypes of identity, so in the present paper we are going to focus on stylization-identity.

Stylization-identification and parody-identification are found in a variety of cultural contexts, and studying of them can give some very interesting results. For instance, the stylization, in our opinion, was the systematic use of Roman republican discourse of citizenship as a model of self-determination by the French revolutionaries in 1789; and the example of parody-identification is the practice of state activities simulation of Slovenian art group *Neue Slowenische Kunst* (creation of the virtual NSK State (see *NSKSTATE.com* 2001–2010)).

Stylization, according to Bakhtin, is a conditional and distanced word that, on the one hand, sounds serious, but, on the other hand, the one who utters it maintains a distance between what is said and him. Stylized identity is constructed in full compliance to Bakhtin's concept. This identity, in our opinion, is manifested in the activities of the various neo-pagan communities, in the work of "historical reenactors", in the so-called "cosplay", in the activities of some political groups (e.g., the monarchists operating under established republican regimes), etc.

In this article we will analyze the stylized identity on the example of "historical reenactors", because their work is creative and products of their creativity have all the signs of stylization, and in these creative products identification processes are clearly manifested.

Historical reenactment as a case of stylized identity

"Historical reenactment" is considered in our article as the systematic operations of primarily amateur enthusiasts who are trying to authentically reproduce material culture and everyday life of certain historical periods and reconstruct relevant histori-

cal events, such as specific real events (Battle of Grunwald, the battles between the Southerners and Northerners during the American Civil War, the Battle of Borodino, etc.) and their generalized images (typical joust, Viking battle, and so on).

In this article, we will not dwell on the origins of this socio-cultural practice (having deep roots), as well as on the question of the authenticity of their products and the public perception of them as authentic. These problems are the subject of many studies: for example, the conception of authenticity is considered in a number of special works (Chronis, Hampton 2008; Cohen 1988; Costa, Bamossy 2001).

It ought to be noted that historical reenactment is often analyzed in such research fields as tourism studies (including those mentioned above works on authenticity), consumer behavior studies, as well as studies of historical memory and educational and pedagogical potential of reenactment (so-called "living history"). In our article we are interested in the aspect of identity on which we are going to focus.

Despite the presence of a game component in the reenactors' creative activity, their activity is usually opposed to the game in its purest form, and the role-playing games in particular, which were wide spread in Russia in the early 1990s due to the massive fad for J. R. R. Tolkien's *The Lord of the Rings* trilogy. Later on, the activity of so-called "role-players" who formed a stable specific subculture, was not so strongly associated with the books of J. R. R. Tolkien, and other stories could be taken as a game plot. There was an "overflow" of some "role-players" to the reenactors' movement, which had originated earlier and on a fundamentally different basis.

At one of the reenactment websites Elena Tokareva, arguing with Ekaterina Zabotkina, author of the article "Historical reenactment-movement as part of the the Russian youth lifestyle" (Zabotkina 2010) in particular, indicates the illegitimacy of identification reenactors as role-players:

> "Role-players recreate works of J. R. R. Tolkien and they do play, they have certain roles, but their activity is not related to science. The phenomenon of military and historical reenactment is a broad social movement, which includes clubs, groups and associations, engaged in the experimental study of military history. By reconstructing clothing, everyday life, and norms of social behavior the members of the movement are trying to achieve the effect of 'immersion' into the past. And reconstruction is performed as close as it can be to a certain epoch in all aspects: recreating military traditions and customs, way of life and the spirit of the military collective, as well as the psychological state of the person. This is what concerns the military-historical reenactment; as regards to historical reenactment (for example, historical fencing), other aspects are taken, but the principle remains" (Tokareva 2010).

It seems to us that the game aspect in the activities of reenactors is also present, but it is submitted to the "historical" component of creative activity, and namely the desire to recreate the details of equipment, everyday life, and human behavior of the epoch. In this regard the role-players' subculture, in contrast, has a pronounced postmodern character, for fantasy worlds reconstituted in the game space are characterized by a larger arbitrariness.

The difference of the reenactment from the collage and assemblage is in the pursuit of some historical authenticity and credibility (as far as it is achievable), unlike

gaming anachronistic strategy of postmodernism. Such features of postmodern world-view as fragmentation, irony, and hybridization (Ihab Hassan's terms) are quite applicable to the practice of role-playing games (Hassan 1988: 18–20).

Role-playing game, in our opinion, is a typical example of postmodern pastiche. Anachronism and fundamental lack of "authenticity" (due to the lack of absolute patterns and universal narrative rules) are quite common in artistic creativity of postmodernists: for example, there is no surprise to the late Renaissance monk with a modern printing machine from Derek Jarman's film *Caravaggio* or Annie Lennox's songs incorporated into the classic text of the play by Christopher Marlowe (screen version of *Edward II* by mentioned Jarman).

Behavior of role-players may range from complete disregard for detail of costumes, weapons, interior, to meticulous recreation of the material environment, which brings these players closer to reenactment. The statements of the reenactment movement participants correlate with the above mentioned characteristics of the postmodern world-view. For example, in the aforementioned article by Zabotkina respondent-reenactor characterizes role-players as follows: they are keen on "brandishing swords made in haste from handy materials", "putting a guard to a ski with a Scotch tape", and "hanging around the woodland park wrapped in a curtain" (Zabotkina 2010). Actually game and socio-psychological motivation dominates the role-playing movement.

However, as already said, the game aspect is present in the creative activity of reenactors as well, and some authors (e.g. Nikolai Bozhok) quite rightly analyze it on the grounds of Johan Huizinga game theory (Bozhok 2013a: 15). It is noted that the fundamental activity for reenactors is "immersion (historicity) effect, which is achieved by self-perception in the eyes of others, initially through the material reconstruction. One of the most difficult tasks of spiritual reconstruction is to recreate the image of thought (and behavior) of the historical object (character)" (Bozhok 2013a: 15).

It is obvious that here we face a peculiar identification process, because on the one hand, there is a desire to recreate the distant era human inner world and to identify oneself with it to a certain extent; on the other hand, there is the distance retention, as the reenactor is a representative of contemporary culture and complete "historical immersion" is obviously impossible for him. This distance characterizes what we call "stylized identity" (or rather stylized statement of identity). According to Bakhtin's thought, stylization always assumes that used stylistic ways previously had a character of a "direct, intentional" word, that means that only a word that was once uttered seriously and had no conditional nature can be styled. Bakhtin's reflections on stylization as an artistic technique are quite applicable to the understanding of identity as a practice of constructing a kind of "inner text", which tells "who oneself is".

Bakhtin notes:

> "Stylization makes someone's presentive intention <...> serve its purposes, i.e. its new intentions. Stylist uses another person's word as another's ones, and this casts a light object shadow on that word. As a matter of fact, the word does not become an object. For the whole set of another's speech ways is important for stylist, just as the expression of a particular point of view. He works with another's point of view" (Bakhtin 2000: 85–86).

Now let us apply this idea of Bakhtin to the analysis of reenactor identity. We found out this character of identification while conducting a preliminary investigation of the problem in the form of semi-formalized expert interviews with some reenactment movement participants in Murmansk. First of all, reenactor, as a rule, reproduces a definite "someone else's point of view" usual for a specific historical epoch, from which he is removed in time.

Communities of reenactors, as noted by Yuri Shachnev, one of the participants of the movement (member of reenactment club "Snow Wolf", focused on the Viking Age) have their "specialization", i.e. are formed in accordance with a particular interest in a certain historical era; therefore reenactors recreating the early Middle Ages are not engaged in the reconstruction of the late Middle Ages, or the Napoleonic Wars, or the World War II era.

In other words, reenactor clearly retains a certain "style" and "point of view" of the era. He speaks not on his own behalf directly, as if he was a "real" historical Viking, but he is not just a spectator, not an "object" watcher, for he still feels that he is a Viking in a way.

Shachnev said in the interview:

> "There are certainly some attractors that prompt to self-identification with the Vikings. Many views of the era are attractive for me, for example, their understanding of friendship, trust <...> doing something for a long time makes an imprint on your real life <…> but, in general, of course I would not like to live in the Middle Ages, for nowadays there are many things greatly simplifying everyday life, but in terms of behavior in different situations, I think there is something to learn from the ancient people" (Shachnev 2014).

As we can see, reenactor exactly "works with another's point of view", in the terms of Bakhtin, but he works keeping a distance, not merging with the "other voice" ultimately. This, according to Bakhtin, is the difference between stylization and imitation:

> "Imitation does not make a form conditional, because it takes an imitated thing seriously, making something it's own, directly assimilating another's word. Here there is a complete fusion of voices <...> stylization can become imitation in a case when stylist's passion to his model destroys the distance and weakens intentional recognition of the style as alien, someone else's one. After all, it is the distance that gave life to the conditionality" (Bakhtin 2000: 86).

Because of the specified distance, stylization-identity has a conditional and "double-voiced" nature, and excessive "immersion" into the recreated era, complete identification with one "voice" – the voice of the recreated era – is likely to be regarded by the reenactors' community as a certain deviation, pathology. Indeed, in this case the principle of constructing text both as identity and as creative product is violated.

As we see it, the task of reenactor is not to "escape" from his time, but to make actual for his time some value and behavioral patterns of another epoch, which seem to subside or vanish, as well as to recreate that special feeling that we would call a "stressful experience of diachrony". That intense experience of one's own staying in History displays modern man beyond synchrony or even achrony.

Mircea Eliade opposed the sacred experience of the cosmic world, peculiar for traditional societies, to the "horror of history", in which a Modernity person resides. But, in our opinion, the postmodern era takes away even this historicity from a person, turning the worldview into a kaleidoscopic device under achronical principle: there is neither Cosmos, nor History, but only a "today", without any roots in memory, in tradition, or even in reflection of "unhappy consciousness". Reenactor's double-voiced identity at least works to recover the experience of History.

However, the historical reenactment researchers prejudice such reconstruction of past to be historical and authentic due to domination of postmodern simulation and significant commercial potential of the reenactment creative activity; they also reflect on what such historical reenactment could give to science and education.

Iain McCalman and Paul A. Pickering note:

> "Writing in 1985 Baudrillard argued that in the postmodern world the image is no longer an obviously artificial place marker for the real thing. On the contrary, the simulation – the simulacrum – is more real than the thing itself. <…> Simulacra are really real. At the same time the 'really real' is not real at all, or at least not necessarily real, a deliberate ambiguity. <…> Baudrillard's notion of a hyperreality comprised of simulacra is a place in which reenactment is flourishing" (McCalman, Pickering 2010: 6).

Thinking about the concept of "real", the authors examine the very foundation of the reenactment activities, outlining some very productive research fields. Discussing the idea of R. G. Collingwood that reenactment and immersion into the studied historical era is an essential dimension of good historical practice, they note that R. G. Collingwood meant purely intellectual activity, not assuming physical or emotional recreation of the past years realities.

They ask the following question: "Is this imaginative process enhanced or derailed by our modern capacity to immerse ourselves in a hyperrealistic visual simulation of past environments with the aid of CGI (Computer-Generated Imagery – *A. S.*) and virtual reality immersion technologies?" (McCalman, Pickering 2010: 4).

Of course, this series of troubling questions is extremely important to fully clarify the philosophical consideration of the problem, but in this article we cannot go into such consideration. We shall note only that making of reenactors' stylized identity is fulfilled relying on "attitude to authenticity" – primarily, the authenticity of recreation of material objects, and, to a certain extent, the authenticity of the affect.

Creative activities of subcultural reenactors' communities (craft, art, and battle and show organization) are based on studies of professional historians without replacing them. It should be taken into consideration that historians themselves may also be engaged in the reenactment activities (in the sense in which we use this concept in this article).

Another expert-interviewee, Igor Tulenkov (head of military and historical reconstruction club "Midgard", coordinator of "On Stones Trees also Grow" festival) stated:

> "Professional historians are very often present in the reenactment surroundings, moreover, many of them are in close contact with the reenactors, because for them it

is a kind of testing ground, i.e. they test their hypotheses and versions. I know people who made up their minds to reproduce the full production cycle of the tenth century sword, starting with bog ore digging, charcoal burning and so on" (Tulenkov 2014).

Shachnev described the information base of reenactors as follows:

"We take information from the Internet, from books and various publications of reputable historians and archaeologists <…> many of us travel different countries, visit museums, take photographs of exhibits, show them to our friends, then try to make, for instance, a similar helmet or something. <…> In the Nordic countries (Sweden, Norway) it is also in common, but there is quite a lot of styling.[4] In Russia we mainly work in compliance with the historical sources, with minimal deviation from the archaeological finds, while they sometimes allow themselves some liberties, for example, some inappropriate embroidery even if it is unknown, whether it was there or not, but they wanted it to be, so they made it, or slightly modified helmets that look pretty weird <…> We maintain contacts with them periodically, they come to the 'Legends of the Norwegian Vikings' festival in Saint Petersburg, the Norwegians are present every year there, and they are more interested in artistry and atmosphere than in scientific approach, they are more for entertainment, although there are serious guys among them" (Shachnev 2014).

Returning to the difference between imitation and stylization, we ought to note that reenactor is always striving for deeper penetration into the "style", that is, the spirit of the era, and not only its external forms, but the very essence of the psychological and social relations. In this regard Shachnev notes:

"In different clubs it may be different, sometimes they even keep the hierarchy: there are drengs or slaves knowing their place, and men-at-arms never speak until the konung says the first word, etc. But it is not always this way, of course, and basically all try to match the exterior. Only appropriate food is also allowed: no potatoes, no tobacco" (Shachnev 2014).

Reconstruction of the material environment is embodied in direct physical acts of handicrafts, and, in our opinion, it plays a paramount role. Getting into someone else's historical context is largely carried out through an intimate relationship with recreated things.

Shachnev (engaged in blacksmithing):

"To be a reenactor, one should be able to do and know a lot <…> there are reenactors who buy clothes and weapons, but this does not mean that they do not know how to make them, simply not everyone has possibility because of work, families, so although they are competent, they have to buy a lot. Not everything, of course: many sew the clothes themselves, and buy castings and weapons. For example, we know how to make anything from iron (weapons, helmets, armor) but we also buy castings, because we do not make them.

It is quite difficult to recreate it all in accordance with the epoch, so we resort to modern technology, but at the festival we try to minimize the use of modern means

---

[4] In this case, the word "styling" is used in the sense of art criticism and means not "striving for an authentic recreation", but simulation of any style using generalizations and conventional techniques.

<...> the form of weapons, their design, sometimes their characteristics correspond to the historical patterns, though, naturally, nowadays iron is not like it used to be, and blacksmith's work methods still remain, thought we use electric tools (drills, grinders) to speed up and simplify the process" (Shachnev 2014) (see Fig. 1).

Fig 1. The blacksmith (Yuri Shachnev) in working process

Through this work the identification with another era is largely carried for a certain part of reenactors. Here we can notice the desire to revive attitude to a thing, which reveals its non-alienated essence, appealing to man. This attitude was typical for pre-industrial societies, highlighted with some anthropological sense of things: people lead them to being and take responsibility for them, and things companion people, being handy and human-fitting.

Vladimir Toporov wrote in this connection in his magnificent work "The thing in the anthropocentric perspective (Plyushkin's Apologia)":

> "Helpless and numb, thing is given under the protection of man and trusts him. Leaving unanswered this move and 'resolution' means ignoring the fate of the "human" layer in things <...> and, making human aspect in things narrow, pushing themselves on the path of reification" (Toporov 1995: 33).

Detachment of modern man from the production of everyday material environment's elements (house, utensils, clothes, and so on), which are produced mainly in large quantities and according to a template (standard layouts of flats, standard clothing, furniture and utensils of the *IKEA* shops, etc.), can be understood as forgetting of self-being in the world of Martin Heidegger's *Gestell*.

Striving for manual labor is an important point to identify oneself as a non-alienated from one's own essence and responsive to the voice of the co-presence in the being of the world. Toporov writes:

> "this feeling of 'warmth' in thing refers to the warmth of man's relationship to things, and this last warmth is a sign of calling to man not only by God from above, but also by thing from below. God calls out to man as his Father. Thing calls out to him as a child who needs a father" (Toporov 1995: 33).

It seems that some of the reenactors are engaged in recreating the material environment, not only to have equipment and "scenery": the activity itself is an identification practice that gives a chance to feel oneself a person of a particular era, not seeing the world as a supermarket, using an ironic expression of Michel Houellebecq.

Here we do not completely agree with Nikolai Bozhok, who writes:

> "It would be better to call these practices historical and social reconstruction, as reconstruction of things for reenactors means requisite making. However, the value of requisite for reconstruction activities and events does not exceed the value of theatrical properties for stage productions. The most important point for reenactment as well as for the theater is social (inter)relations, based on specific aesthetics, speech and non-speech ethics and ideology of youth communities, united under the general title of 'historical reenactment'" (Bozhok 2013b: 199).

We believe that creative activity of reenactor differs from theatrical activity, since the latter rather falls under Bakhtin's definition of "object" identification having "one-voiced" character. Reenactor not so much portrays something to the public as experience a stylized attitude to the world, not only on the psychological level, but also on the level of somatic. The important moment in reenactor's stylized identity is the moment of assumption of "another's word" through bodily action, through hand action, and not only at the time of "theatrical" shows or battles, but in a much greater degree in the preparatory phase, in proprietary productive activities. As Heidegger wrote,

> "hand in its essence retains the relationship between 'being' and man. <…> 'Hand' is only where being as such appears unhidden and man relates to this being revealingly. <…> Hand hand-acts. It keeps action in caring, as well as what was the object of its impact and underwent treatment. So if something essential was essentially preserved, we say that it fell 'in good hands', even if there is no need to resort to any direct manual techniques and skills" (Heidegger 1982: 124–125).

It is work with hands that reveals the past (incarnated in a reconstructed thing as being) for reenactor, i.e. directs him towards the true being of thing.

Of course, the recreation of "another's world" cannot be only due to material creative activity – a spiritual component in the form of a narrative is required here. For reenactors engaged in the Viking Age, such a narrative is composed of Scandinavian myths, songs of *Poetic Edda*, skaldic poetry, Icelandic sagas, chronicles, as well as historical research, interpreting life and mentality of the Vikings.

It seems that the formation of this narrative is also being significantly influenced by modern popular culture, which in various forms adapts historical knowledge to a wider audience with inevitable distortions and anachronisms, starting with children's books about the Vikings and finishing with the production of cinema and music industry (there is even such a sub-genre of metal music as Viking metal).

Bakhtin wrote that in the case of stylization…

> …"author's intention uses another person's word in the direction of its own intentions. Stylization stylized another's style in the direction of its own tasks, but making these tasks conditional. <…> Entering the person's word and settling in it, author's intention does not come into collision with another's intention, following its direction, but making this direction conditional" (Bakhtin 2000: 89–90).

To stylize the material environment of life and worldview of the Viking means to be a Viking, but this existence as a Viking is conditional. Reenactor as the author of this stylized identity follows the intentions of a Viking, but there is a distance between them, causing conditional character of "Modern Vikings" behavior: it does not come to his mind to equip a drakkar, gather a squad of thugs with weapons of war, and go rob surrounding coastal villages. By the way, reenactors' weapons essentially embody this conditionality: unsharpened, though authentically reproduced swords, real, though not intended for live firing guns, etc.

Tulenkov characterizes the reenactment motives:

> "Reenactment does give you the possibility to communicate with people, avoiding those conventions to which we are accustomed in the modern world. On the site no one is interested who you are in the 'real' life – a mechanic or a manager – you are evaluated according to what you are worth on this site. One's self-identification changes in the community and the community identification also changes. The quintessence of this is combat component because it throws away all superficial, that appeared in the last thousand of years, although it is clear that we are not trying to hurt or kill each other. <…> The main attractor is opportunity to pull away your mask and try some other, to touch something, feel it with your skin, with your hands" (Tulenkov 2014).

What exactly are the intentions of the modern reenactor, following the intentions of another in their direction, which we have found in our preliminary outline of the issue?

Firstly, as already noted, this stylized identification allows filling value gaps of today's society. Tulenkov and Shachnev, speaking of identification processes in the reenactment surroundings, emphasized mainly the value aspects.

Secondly, stylized identity gives a chance to compensate the absence of certain forms of behavior and everyday life in modern society (battles as a way of overcoming the internal aggression; living in the woods in conditions close to the medieval as an opportunity to have a rest from the excessive pressure of the urban environment, etc.).

Thirdly, we cannot exclude the motive of escapism, to which the interviewees also drew attention: a kind of escape into a parallel imaginary reality, opposed to the reality of our days.

Fourthly, stylized identity manifests the "will to history", the desire to find oneself in the flow of history.

Fifth, such stylization can be a way of constructing and maintaining regional and geographical identity. So, as was said by Shachnev:

> "This is not only a historical connection, but also geographical, regional one, and the latter is probably the main one – for I always wanted to believe that my motherland is not Russia as a whole, but namely the North, and therefore it is easier to associate myself with Vikings" (Shachnev 2014).

Historical reenactment and creative industries

Reenactors create not only an inner text of their identity, but also an outward text in the form of a creative product, manifesting identity created in an order of stylization. Here we reveal the connection with the craft, art, mass events organization practice, i.e. those areas of activity that are relevant to the field of creative industry. Obviously, creativity potential of the reenactment movement is great, and investigation of the possibilities of its use is an important area of research.

Here are some possible aspects of research: finding out the key areas of creative production in the reenactment movement; characterizing of social and economic relations within individual communities and between communities; analyzing of the historical reenactment creative potential for the development of some types of tourism; researching mass-entertaining and educational possibilities of reenactment movement, etc. And those aspects do not exhaust the entire field of research.

Of course, the activity of reenactors is mainly a hobby, it involves a number of enthusiasts, and most often it is informal and non-institutionalized. Thus, the above-mentioned historical reenactment clubs of the Murmansk town ("Midgard" and "Snow Wolf") have no official status, functioning as informal subcultural communities.

The same can be said about the other reenactment associations of similiar specialization (the Early Middle Ages, the Vikings' era), situated in the Murmansk region (in the towns of Kandalaksha and Polarnye Zory). However, the number of their members is quite small: in a rough estimate of Tulenkov, in the Murmansk region there are about 70 people who are more or less active members of the Early Middle Ages historical reenactment community. However, reenactment groups can have official status and much more members, and these differences are also to be described and comprehended.

Having a notion of the informal and amateur, "hobby-like" nature of the reenactors' activities, we cannot quite correct speak about their creative production as a segment of creative industry. Moreover, the transfer of their activities into completely commercial, economic mainstream would probably be in conflict with the very essence of the movement, because it is meant to reveal man's search for some additional (and probably alternative) identities, ways of life, and ways of relating to other people. However, the relationship with the creative industry is present, although not always in the developed forms.

The artisanal (handmade) handicraft products are an integral component of creative manifestation of reenactors' stylized identity. As we tried to substantiate, the conditional double-voiced identity is being formed exactly in this manual production. Reenactors make many different things. Some make them exclusively for themselves, some are involved in barter (for their own needs one thing is exchanged to another), but it is obvious that there is also commerce.

Some of such these things-makers sell them irregularly, due to usability of these things, but the other part of the reenactors is engaged in regular production for sale. Among the latter we find people with special artistic or applied education, for whom the making of material objects is not only a way of self-actualization, but also a way of earning.

Igor Tulenkov notes: "There is a mercantile point here: sometimes it is cheaper to make it myself than to buy. And, of course, it is interesting trying to make a lot of things yourself. As for the artisans, I know many people for whom the reenactment is both a hobby and a job" (Tulenkov 2014). Therefore, the considered subcultural environment can become (and in many cases has actually become) a reservoir of serious projects of the creative industry in the full sense of the word.

It is interesting that the way of economic activity organization within the Early Middle Ages reenactment community reproduces medieval principles. Tulenkov, in particular, said:

> "As in any subculture, internal connections are beginning to arise: one is good at bone cutting, the other can make blades for knives, yet another can make something else, and so internal trade relations are beginning to form. To some extent, it is the very model of a medieval society. There is a potter, a carpenter, a blacksmith – so the guild structure starts. So craft relationships within the community and between communities arise" (Tulenkov 2014).

In other words, the creative activity of the reenactment subculture, due to the fact that it manifests a stylized double-voiced identity, is at the same time constructed as a kind of stylization of socio-economic structures and relationships inherent to the era. For example, preparing of a significant Vikings' fight demands participation of many artisans with a certain specialization, i.e. there forms a kind of a team with diverse abilities and skills. Here one can see an analogue of the economic characteristics of the creative industries, which Richard E. Caves called "motley crew principle" (Caves 2000).

We should not forget about the role played by art in the formation and maintenance of a stylized identity (music, poetry, theatrical performances). This creative segment, based on the revival of folk traditions, on the reconstruction of ancient musical instruments, on the restoration of ancient celebrations, etc., also has serious potential for development and a wider application beyond a single subculture.

Synthesis of the reenactors' creative activities is fulfilled in festivals, combining all aspects of their creativity and demonstrating the main achievements to the public not involved in the subculture (see Fig. 2).

Fig 2. Fighting episode from "On Stones Trees Also Grow" festival

According to the expert Tulenkov,

> "we hold both domestic private events (for example, two times we celebrated Yule in December), and events for the public. This format is interesting because you can invite participants from other cities, it works for the popularization of this form of recreation, and finally, even though I try to avoid big words, it is an attempt to arouse interest in our own history" (Tulenkov 2014).

All reenactment festivals targeted at a broad audience, are similar in concept, and there are some basic models, which form all the action. However, it introduces an element of the show, for exclusively reenactment approach is likely to leave the viewers indifferent. Tulenkov gave costume contest as an example: "If we hold it for ourselves, the viewers probably will fall asleep on the second competitor, for it will be a protection of the diploma on a historical theme, so for the public some gaming, theatrical elements are introduced, or everything is simplified to a fashion parade" (Tulenkov 2014).

Conclusions

Analysis of creative activity's products should take into consideration characteristics of socio-cultural identity of their author, especially in those cases where this activity is a direct manifestation of identification processes. The methodological basis for the study of this issue can be grounded in Bakhtin's dialogic approach, which allows distinguishing different types of identification statements and applying them to the analysis of creative products. Offered types of direct, object and double-voiced (ambivalent) identities give us possibility to understand different ways of persons' attitudes to their self-image.

Stylization-identity as a subtype of double-voiced identity can manifest itself in a variety of cultural and subcultural phenomena, one of which is historical reenactment. As we have shown, this kind of creative activity gave rise to a separate subculture, uniting people with intense interest in history, serious creativity and a high level of motivation, the latter is largely due to the desire for self-development. In our opinion, studying of specific reenactors' communities will allow to see in proper perspective their possible inclusion in the historical and patriotic programs and regular projects of creative industry.

References

Bakhtin, M. M. 1997. Zametki, in Bakhtin, M. M. *Sobranie sochinenij v 7-mi t.t.* T. 5. Moskva: Russkie slovari, 329–363.

Bakhtin, M. M. 2000. Problemy tvorchestva Dostoevskogo, in Bakhtin, M. M. *Sobranie sochinenij v 7-mi t.t.* T. 2. Moskva: Russkie slovari, 7–175.

Bozhok, N. S. 2013a. *Dvizhenie istoricheskoj rekonstruktsii kak fenomen molodezhnoj kul'tury.* Saratov: Saratovskij gosudarstvennyj tekhnicheskij universitet.

Bozhok, N. S. 2013b. Sotsiologicheskoe soderzhanie ponyatiya "istoricheskaya rekonstruktsiya", *Vestnik Saratovskogo gosudarstvennogo tekhnicheskogo universiteta* 3(72): 197–201.

Caves, R. E. 2000. *Creative Industries: Contracts between Art and Commerce*. Harvard: University Press.

Chronis, A.; Hampton, R. D. 2008. Consuming the Authentic Gettysburg: How a Tourist Landscape Becomes an Authentic Experience, *Journal of Consumer Behaviour* 7(2): 111–126. http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/cb.241

Cohen, E. 1988. Authenticity and Commoditization in Tourism, *Annals of Tourism Research* 15: 371–386. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0160-7383(88)90028-X

Costa, J. A.; Bamossy, G. J. 2001. Le Parc Disney: Creating an "Authentic" American experience, *Advances in Consumer Research* 28: 398–402.

Hassan, I. 1988. Pluralism in Posmodern Perspective, in Calinescu, M.; Fokkema, D. (Eds.). *Exploring Postmodernism: Selected Papers Presented at a Workshop on Postmodernism at the XIth International Comparative Literature Congress,* 20–24 August 1985, Paris. Utrecht: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 17–40.

Heidegger, M. 1982. Parmenides, in Heidegger, M. *Gesamtausgabe*. Abt. 2, Bd. 54. Frankfurt am Mein: Vittorio Klostermann.

Kristeva, YU. 2000. Bakhtin, slovo, dialog i roman, in Kristeva, YU. *Frantsuzskaya semiotika: Ot strukturalizma k poststrukturalizmu*. Moskva: Progress, 427–457.

McCalman, I.; Pickering, P. A. 2010. From Realism to the Affective Turn: An Agenda, in McCalman I.; Pickering P. A. (Eds.) Historical Reenactment: From Realism to the Affective Turn, Palgrave Macmillan, 1–17.

NSKSTATE.com 2001–2010. [Cited 2 July 2014].

Shachnev, Y. 2014. Data of Interview with Yuri Shachnev Carried out by Alexander Sautkin 15.07.2014. [Transcript of an audio recording].

Tokareva, E. 2010. *Forum ural'skikh voennykh rekonstruktorov "49-ya pekhotnaya diviziya"* [online], [cited 2 July 2014]. Available from Internet: http://pehota.zbord.ru/viewtopic.php?t=635

Toporov, V. N. 1995. Veshh'v antropotsentricheskoj perspektive (apologiya Plyushkina), in Toporov, V. N. *Mif. Ritual. Simvol. Obraz. Issledovaniya v oblasti mifopoehticheskogo.* Moskva: Progress – Kul'tura, 7–111.

Tulenkov, I. 2014. Data of Interview with Igor Tulenkov Carried out by Alexander Sautkin 23.07.2014. [Transcript of an audio recording].

Zabotkina, E. 2010. *Istorichesko-rekonstruktorskoe dvizhenie kak chast' obraza zhizni rossijskoj molodezhi* [online], [2 July 2014]. Available from Internet: http://ecsocman.hse.ru/text/33373330/

PRAEITIES INSCENIZACIJA KAIP STILIZUOTAS TAPATUMAS IR JO KŪRYBINIS POTENCIALAS: BACHTINIŠKOJI PRIEIGA PRIE SOCIOKULTŪRINIO TAPATUMO

Alexander SAUTKIN

Santrauka

Šiame straipsnyje analizuojamas sociokultūrinis tapatumas, išreiškiamas kūrybinėje veikloje. Metodologinis pagrindas – Michailo Bachtino dialogo principas. Tai sudaro galimybę tipologizuoti tapatumo konstravimo ir raiškos būdus. Yra trys pagrindiniai tipai: tiesioginis, objektyvusis ir dvibalsis (ambivalentiškasis)

tapatumas. Ypatingas dvibalsio tapatumo atvejis – tai stilizuotas tapatumas, nurodantis tam tikros vertės reprodukavimą ir elgesio modelius, išsaugant jų atžvilgiu tam tikrą atstumą. Stilizuotas tapatumas tyrinėjamas remiantis praeities inscenizacijos subkultūros pavyzdžiu. Teorinius svarstymus iliustruoja Murmansko (Rusija) inscenizavimo klubų, atkūrusių vikingų epochą, kūrybinės veiklos studija. Praeities inscenizacija vertinama kaip galimas kūrybinių industrijų projektų vystymo šaltinis.

Reikšminiai žodžiai: kūrybos produktas, dialogiškumas, praeities inscenizavimas, tapatumas, stilizavimas.